

Dear Sabrina Forrest:

October 23, 2011

I recently became aware that the United States EPA is in the process of turning Cement Creek, and possibly other adjacent areas into a Superfund site. As a resident of Silverton, Colorado I strongly oppose the EPA's efforts to make Cement Creek, and its adjacent areas a Superfund site.

Environmental issues in the Silverton area are a matter of local concern. As such, decisions how to address these issues should be made by residents who live and work in the area, and are in the best position to assess costs and benefits associated with local activities. We have a local stakeholder group – The Animas River Stakeholders Group (ASRG) dedicated to addressing water quality issues. The ASRG is committed to finding practical and cooperative solutions to existing water quality issues, and is not handcuffed by the burdensome procedures and inflexible cleanup standards imposed by an EPA Superfund designation.

I am respectfully requesting this matter regarding Cement Creek be left under the direction of the ASRG, and the local citizens of Silverton. They are not the Federal Government, and are in the best position to find sensible, cost-effective solutions to this local issue.

Sincerely,

Kevin E. Baldwin
PO Box 283
Silverton, Colorado 81433



**UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
REGION 8**

1595 Wynkoop Street
DENVER, CO 80202-1129
Phone 800-227-8917
<http://www.epa.gov/region08>

February 1, 2012

Mr. Kevin Baldwin
P.O. Box 283
Silverton, CO 81433

RE: Upper Cement Creek, CO.

Dear Mr. Baldwin:

Thank you for your October 23, 2011 letter regarding Upper Cement Creek.

We have heard from a number of citizens and other stakeholders who have voiced interest in working collaboratively to address water quality in Upper Cement Creek. We'd like to assure you that the United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) has not made a decision concerning listing of the Upper Cement Creek area. The decision to propose a site for the National Priorities List (NPL) can only be made after a technical evaluation is completed to determine if the site is eligible. The EPA is just completing this technical evaluation. In addition, both the State and the EPA seek community support prior to a site being proposed for listing and the EPA wants the community to understand why we are looking at this option.

More than 15 years ago the EPA committed to a community-based environmental protection effort in San Juan County, and indicated that Superfund would not be used as long as progress was being made in improving water quality in the Animas River. Unfortunately, water quality has significantly degraded in the Animas River in the last five years. It is evident that historic mine waste in Cement Creek, a tributary of the Animas River, is having a negative impact on the Animas. These impacts are likely related to cessation of water treatment in Gladstone and plugging of the American Tunnel. The EPA has compared the last five years of data to earlier data sets that indicated improvements in water quality. The Animas River Stakeholder Group (ARSG) has summarized some of these data and the EPA is also evaluating these data. If experience in other mining impacted areas is any guide, the resources required for solutions to this sort of problem will be substantial, and long-term operation and maintenance of the solution or solutions may be required.

EPA is working with other federal agencies, the State, and local community members to identify options to reverse the degradation and improve water quality in the Animas River. It is too soon to make conclusions about how best to correct this condition. However, if the best solutions require substantial and long-term resources, CERCLA process and the NPL may be the only means to assure that full resources available to the EPA can be committed. EPA is also limited in its ability to fund interim

actions and long-term projects that require ongoing operations and maintenance.

The EPA looks forward to continuing the dialogue with you and other community members regarding possible options to address water quality issues in Upper Cement Creek. If you would like to discuss this further, please contact me at 303-312-6607.

Sincerely,

Michael Holmes
Project Manager